

MINUTES OF MEETING
ALAMEDA COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION
FEBRUARY 4, 2008
(Approved March 3, 2008)

FIELD TRIP:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Mike Jacob; Glen Kirby, Chair; Kathie Ready and Richard Rhodes.

MEMBERS EXCUSED: Commissioners Ken Carbone, Vice Chair; Frank Imhof and Alane Loisel

OTHERS PRESENT: Andrew Young, Planner

The Commission convened at 224 W. Winton Avenue, Room 111, Hayward, California, at the hour of 1:30 p.m. and adjourned to the field to visit the following properties:

1. **ZONING UNIT, ZU-2257 – FRANK ANDRADE** ~ Petition to reclassify from the R-S-SU (Suburban Residence, Secondary Unit) District to the P-D (Planned Development) District, so as to allow four dwelling units on one site containing approximately 0.37 acres located at 20815 Cambridge Avenue, west side, approximately 200 feet north of Medford Avenue, Cherryland area of Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 414-0041-012-00. **Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper**

2. **ZONING UNIT, ZU-2252 and TENTATIVE PARCEL MAP, PM-9712 – JAMES ANDRADE** ~Petition to reclassify from the R-S-D-20 (Suburban Residence, 2,000 square feet Minimum Building Site Area per dwelling unit) District to the P-D (Planned Development) District, so as to allow subdivision of one site containing approximately 0.34 acres into four parcels of less than 3,000 net square feet and construction of four detached single family residences and allow site-specific development standards, located at 20540 Forest Avenue, east side, approximately 540 feet north of Vincent Court, Castro Valley area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 084C-0117-009-01.**Staff Planner: Andrew Young**

3. **MODIFIED ZONING UNIT, MZU-2106 and CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, C-8706 – GEORGE MARK CHILDREN'S HOUSE** ~ Petition to allow minor modification of the 2106th Zoning Unit, to be implemented by Conditional Use Permit, C-8706, to allow construction of a 525 square-foot detached storage building for linen, housekeeping, beds and wheelchairs as well as refrigerated and frozen food storage, on one site containing approximately 71 acres, located at 2121 George Mark Lane, northeast of 155th Avenue, Fairmont area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 080A-0153-010-00.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper

4. **TENTATIVE TRACT MAP, TR-7898 and SITE DEVELOPMENT REVIEW, S-2123 –BRYANT/GILBERT** ~Petition to allow construction of ten condominium units and subdivision of one site containing approximately 0.49 acres into ten parcels in the ACBD Specific Plan – RC (Ashland/Cherryland business District specific Plan – Residential/Commercial) District, located at 477 E. Lewelling Boulevard, south side, approximately 100 feet south east of Bar Avenue, San Lorenzo area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor’s Parcel Number: 413-0031-009-00. **Staff Planner: Andrew Young**

5. **DETERMINATION, D-163 – ECHO LANDSCAPE** ~Planning Director-initiated Determination by the Planning Commission as to whether Echo Landscape is a permitted or conditional permitted use in the M-2 (Heavy Industrial) District, located at 2401 Grant Avenue, northwest side, approximately 250 feet west of Railroad Avenue, San Lorenzo area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor’s Parcel Number: 080G-1178-003-02. **Staff Planner: Richard Tarbell**

6. **MODIFIED ZONING UNIT, MZU-1537 and CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, C-8711 - EDEN HOUSING, INC/ASHLAND VILLAGE** ~ Petition to allow modification of the 1537th Zoning Unit (to be implemented by Conditional Use Permit, C-8711) and allow construction of a new community building on one site containing approximately 7.5 acres, in the PD-ZU-1537 (Planned Development, 1537th Zoning Unit) District, located at 1300 Kentwood Lane, east side, terminus of 165th Avenue, Ashland area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor’s Parcel Number: 080B-0300-002-05. **Staff Planner: Christine Greene**

7. **TENTATIVE TRACT MAP, TR-7918 – LANGON GROUP** ~ Petition to allow a 40-unit residential condominium project on two contiguous parcels containing approximately 5,000 and 32,5000 square feet, in Subarea-11, Landuse Group D, located at 21019 Baker Road, approximately 600 feet south of Castro Valley Boulevard, Castro Valley area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor’s Parcel Numbers: 084A-0016-008-02 and 084A-0016-009-02. **Staff Planner: Howard Lee**

REGULAR MEETING: 6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Ken Carbone, Vice-Chair; Frank Imhof; Mike Jacob; Glenn Kirby, Chair; Alane Loisel; Kathie Ready and Richard Rhodes.

OTHERS PRESENT: Chris Bazar, Planning Director; Rodrigo Orduña, Senior Planner; Arthur Valderrama, Public Works Agency Liaison; Brian Washington, County Counsel’s Office; Nilma Singh, Recording Secretary.

There were approximately thirteen people in the audience.

CALL TO ORDER: The Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE CHAIR: *None*

OPEN FORUM: Open forum is provided for any members of the public wishing to speak on an item not listed on the agenda. Each speaker is limited to three (3) minutes.

Craig Lewis, Vice-President of Government Relations, GreenVolts, with a powerpoint presentation explained their company background, mission, pending application for a solar energy plant in Alameda County, GV1, project status and schedule. This project is based in Byron with construction beginning in Spring 2008; the first phase to be deployed in Fall '08; no foundation will be required and will provide the highest clean and environmentally friendly project. A CUP application was submitted on February 4, 2008 and will be heard by the East County Board of Zoning Adjustments.

The Chair thanked him for the presentation noting that since this is under Open Forum and the matter will be heard by EBZA, the Commission is restricted to limited comments. Regarding the project, he did not feel that screening would be necessary. Commissioner Jacob asked if the site is adjacent to the PGE substation. Mr. Lewis replied yes and, in response to Commissioner Carbone, explained that the plant will cover 2,000 homes.

CONSENT CALENDAR:

1. Approval of Commission Minutes – January 22, 2008 ~ continued to February 19, 2008.

REGULAR CALENDAR:

1. **ZONING UNIT, ZU-2257 – FRANK ANDRADE – *Preliminary Plan Review*** ~ Petition to reclassify from the R-S-SU (Suburban Residence, Secondary Unit) District to the P-D (Planned Development) District, so as to allow four dwelling units on one site containing approximately 0.37 acres located at 20815 Cambridge Avenue, west side, approximately 200 feet north of Medford Avenue, Cherryland area of Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 414-0041-012-00.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper

Mr. Orduñ presented the staff report.

Public testimony was called for. Frank Andrade, applicant, explained the following in support of his project: if the size of the unit is a concern, he is willing to expand into the workshop area to increase the size to 600 square feet, which will not affect the parking area, or the unit could be two-stories; the unit will provide affordable rental housing; a secondary unit is not proposed, which would require a subdivision; there are several other garage conversions in the neighborhood; and the unit will be a positive addition to the community. The Chair announced that the Commission had visited the property today. The density is an issue and a subdivision is not possible due to the location of the garage and access concerns, which would also nullify the

existing variance on the property. Commissioner Ready said that she is not impressed with the project. The Chair recommended working with staff on a much-approved redesign especially on the appropriateness of the unit and access.

Public testimony was closed. The Commission concurred with staff recommendation. Commissioner Jacob requested that the following be included in future staff reports: separate findings for all PD applications; a description of the allowable density; and a description of the Secondary Unit Policy. The Chair pointed out that although this application appears to be for a secondary unit, it is a PD. *The matter was continued to a future date, yet to be determined.*

2. **ZONING UNIT, ZU-2252 and TENTATIVE PARCEL MAP, PM-9712 – JAMES ANDRADE - Preliminary Plan Review** ~Petition to reclassify from the R-S-D-20 (Suburban Residence, 2,000 square feet Minimum Building Site Area per dwelling unit) District to the P-D (Planned Development) District, so as to allow subdivision of one site containing approximately 0.34 acres into four parcels of less than 3,000 net square feet and construction of four detached single family residences and allow site-specific development standards, located at 20540 Forest Avenue, east side, approximately 540 feet north of Vincent Court, Castro Valley area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 084C-0117-009-01. **Staff Planner: Andrew Young**

Mr. Orduñ presented the staff report.

Public testimony was called for. Craig Ragg, representing Mr. Andrade, made a correction to the staff report that the units are not condominiums but detached, single family homes, similar to the Roxy Way Development on Redwood Road. In reference to ingress/egress issue, the Fire Department has suggested keeping the sidewalk at grade level and to delineate the difference between the sidewalk and the driveway; providing the width of 19 feet, just short of the required 20 feet, would not be an issue if the units are fire sprinkled. Eliminating the fourth guest parking space will provide additional space for turnaround. The applicant will continue working with Public Works on the ingress/egress issues including the location of bio-swells on the north and south sides. A geotech report is also available. Mr. Ragg pointed out that the land use has been reduced from seven townhomes to four single family homes. Commissioner Imhof suggested perhaps installing pavers to provide extra driveway width. The Chair noted the lack of any significant concerns but recommended working with staff.

Commissioner Jacob asked if there are any concerns regarding pedestrian safety on the designated aggregated walkway at the same elevation as the driveway. Staff explained that there are no specific data to provide clear evidence. Mr. Valderrama, Public Works Agency representative, added that the standard curb cut is six inches and roll-curb cuts have not been used recently in road designs. A discussion followed regarding different types of curb cuts, texture/scoring of surfaces, safety issues, sight-line issues and ADA accessibility concerns. The Commission agreed that their concern is the driveway width only. *The matter was continued to an unspecified future date.*

3. **MODIFIED ZONING UNIT, MZU-2106 and CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, C-8706 – GEORGE MARK CHILDREN'S HOUSE** ~ Petition to

allow minor modification of the 2106th Zoning Unit, to be implemented by Conditional Use Permit, C-8706, to allow construction of a 525 square-foot detached storage building for linen, housekeeping, beds and wheelchairs as well as refrigerated and frozen food storage, on one site containing approximately 71 acres, located at 2121 George Mark Lane, northeast of 155th Avenue, Fairmont area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 080A-0153-010-00.

Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper

Mr. Orduñ presented the staff report and the Chair added that the Commission had visited the site today for a brief tour. He was pleased with the success.

Public testimony was called for. The project architect said that he had designed the original complex four years ago, but that the use now has run out of space within the existing building. The Chair requested clarification on proposed access modifications. The project architect replied that the existing ramp on the east will be the primary access to the parking area; the proposal would eliminate the secondary access and relocate the handicap space closer to the chapel.

Public testimony was closed. Commissioner Imhof made the motions to approve the findings of the minor modification and adopt staff recommendation for an approval for the CUP. Commissioner Loisel seconded. Both motions carried unanimously.

4. **TENTATIVE TRACT MAP, TR-7898 and SITE DEVELOPMENT REVIEW, S-2123 –BRYANT/GILBERT** ~Petition to allow construction of ten condominium units and subdivision of one site containing approximately 0.49 acres into ten parcels in the ACBD Specific Plan – RC (Ashland/Cherryland business District specific Plan – Residential/Commercial) District, located at 477 E. Lewelling Boulevard, south side, approximately 100 feet south east of Bar Avenue, San Lorenzo area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 413-0031-009-00. **Staff Planner: Andrew Young**

Mr. Orduñ presented the staff report, adding that staff has submitted an Addendum to include comments from Friends of the San Lorenzo Creek. The Chair added that the Commission could not get on the property during the Field Trip. Commissioner Ready asked if the sidewalk requirement is included in the Conditions of Approval and the Chair requested clarification on the fencing requirement, specifically in the rear, facing the channel. Staff replied that sidewalk improvement is required as part of this development and a 4-foot high fence will be provided in the front; no fence is proposed for the rear of the development in order to take advantage of views of the Meek Estate. Details on the front fence material are being worked out with the applicant. Mr. Valderrama added that their recommendation is to convert the existing masonry wall at the rear of the property into a flood wall and any other features installed on top, if built, will have to withstand a 100 year flood.

Public testimony was called for. Richard Gilbert, co-applicant, explained that the front landscape fencing is 4-feet or less; there is no fencing proposed in the rear to allow for the view of the park across the channel. Screening for the utility boxes at the front of the property will be provided. Regarding the future width line dedication, Mr. Gilbert pointed out that the lack of

storm water drains will result in a collection of water in front of the subject property. He is willing to install temporary sidewalk/landscaping to the current existing road until the widening occurs which will still allow four on-street parking spaces.

Public testimony was closed. Commissioner Carbone requested clarification on parking. Staff explained that the required parking of two spaces per unit is being met; depending on the design Alternative chosen guest parking will be provided by a varying combination of on-site and on-street parking. One alternative is to provide two required resident parking spaces at the rear of the property, which will result in the elimination of two on-site guest parking spaces. The other alternative would provide two required resident parking spaces within each two-car garage underneath each unit, so that all on-site surface parking would be dedicated for guests. He further explained Alternative Plans A and B. Commissioner Ready pointed out the lack of any driveway apron. Commissioner Carbone said that he was not against the project but it is too dense and more consideration should be given to on-site parking as street parking is not an alternative for this area. The Chair noted that the neighboring properties on both sides are one-story but underdeveloped and, as such, did not feel that this project should be constrained from development of three stories. Commissioner Ready said that she was disappointed and did not see a style and expressed height concerns. Commissioner Rhodes agreed with Commissioner Carbone regarding density and parking, and voiced concern with the possibility of the garages used for storage. Commissioner Jacob concurred with the Chair regarding the height issue. However, the density is within the proposed plan and existing plan requirements. Guest parking also meets the requirement. His only concern is the Condo Guidelines. However, this project is not a condo conversion and the Guidelines are only guidelines. Maybe the project can be redesigned to provide more on-site guest parking and with land dedication, there would be some space in the front along the street. The Chair said that his concern is providing viable parking spaces in the front before the improvements in the right-of-way are done; those improvements are yet to be defined. He suggested that perhaps the applicant would like a continuance to work further with staff. A discussion followed regarding the location of the front fence, on-site parking, and the possibility of a CC&R condition requiring that the garage be maintained for parking only.

Commissioner Jacob made a motion to continue the matter for a month to allow time for the Applicant to work with staff on the right-of-way improvement, and redesign based on alternative B with additional aesthetics and with a goal of finding additional off-street guest parking and with Public Works on the temporary curb issues. Commissioner Ready reiterated height concerns. Commissioner Loisel seconded and the motion carried unanimously.

STAFF COMMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE: Mr. Bazar announced the re-appointment of Commissioner Jacob tomorrow morning.

CHAIRS REPORT: *None.*

COMMISSION ANNOUNCEMENT, COMMENTS AND REPORTS: Commissioner Ready expressed concern on the Commission's lack of access to properties during the Field Trip. She requested another site visit to the Echo Landscaping property, additional lease information on the property and if it is County property. Mr. Bazar indicated that perhaps Public Works staff be in attendance at the next meeting. A discussion followed regarding Determinations, County right to sub-lease, and use on a vacant parcel.

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business, Commissioner Jacob moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:00 p.m. Commissioner Loisel seconded the motion. The motion was carried 7/0.

CHRIS BAZAR, SECRETARY
COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION OF ALAMEDA COUNTY